



**COURTHOUSE PLAZA ART SELECTION PANEL**

Meeting Minutes

**Thursday, June 1, 2023 4:00 - 5:30 PM**

**Jessie Ball DuPont Center Conference Room 202**

LINK: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82047582940> | Meeting ID: 820 4758 2940 | PHONE: +1 646 558 8656

**ASP Members In-Person:** Kimberly Kim (Chair), Chief Judge Mark Mahon, Chris Flagg, Caitlin Doherty, Ann-Marie Knight, Judge Dawn Hudson, Lori Boyer

**ASP Attendees Online:** None

**ASP Members Absent:** Teresa Eichner

**Guests:** Ari Jolly (CCGJ Board Chair), Joelle Dillard (OGC), Karen Bowden (CCGJ Legal - ABL Law, P.A.), Carissa Marques (Wingard)

**CCGJ Staff:** Diana Donovan (CCGJ Executive Director), Kat Wright (CCGJ Director of Public Art), Samantha Burns (CCGJ Public Art Project Manager), Michele Lee (Contracted CCGJ Public Art Project Manager)

**Presenting Artists:** Cliff Garten (Artist)

**General Public:** None

---

**WELCOME & CALL TO ORDER, Kimberly Kim**

- ASP Chair Kimberly Kim called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Chair Kim stated the purpose of the meeting:

*This Art Selection Panel is gathered today to review the Revised Final Design Package by Cliff Garten Studio titled "These Truths: Voices of Jacksonville," which includes the revised text content to be reflected in the design of the sculpture so as to potentially proceed to fabrication.*
- Attendance was taken via roll call.

**ASP RESOLUTION REVIEW, Kimberly Kim**

- The resolutions were read aloud by ASP Chair Kim:
  - o *Section 1. The recitals set forth above are true and correct and are hereby incorporated herein by this reference.*
  - o *Section 2. (Version 1). The ASP hereby approves the substance and placement of the Artwork text as set forth in Exhibit "A" attached hereto and requests final approval by the Art in Public Places Committee; provided that the Executive Director ("Executive Director") of the Cultural Council of Greater Jacksonville (the "Cultural Council") is hereby authorized to administratively approve grammatical or other typographical errors to the Artwork text (but not any other changes to content or placement of any Artwork text). The ASP confirms that the shape and dimensions of the overall Project are hereby approved provided that the Executive Director is hereby authorized to approve minor structural modifications of the Project based upon final engineering of the Project.*
- Chair Kim confirmed that the Panel members in attendance had reviewed the revisions by the Artist to the Artwork text.
- Chair Kim then continued to review the ASP resolution options.
  - o *[Section 2. (Version 2). The ASP directs Cliff Garten Studio to make the following changes or additions to the Artwork text which is attached hereto as Exhibit "A" and return to the ASP for approval prior to \_\_\_\_\_, 2023:  
Additional Conditions:\_\_\_\_\_*
  - o *[Section 2. (Version 3). The ASP hereby determines that an impasse has been reached and withdraws its recommendation to award the public art contract for the Project to Cliff Garten Studio. The ASP further directs the Executive Director to terminate further*

*negotiations with Cliff Garten Studio, and conclude the Cultural Council's relationship with Cliff Garten Studio for the Project.*

- *Section 3. The Effective Date of this Resolution is the date upon the execution of this resolution by the Chair of the ASP.*

#### **PROPOSAL EVALUATION / DISCUSSION, ASP**

- Chair Kim sought questions from the Panel, if any, to the Artist.
- Chief Judge Mahon stated that his only question was in regard to the inclusion of EQUITY as part of the title words chosen for the Artwork. Chief Judge Mahon stated that the constitutional basis for the inclusion of the words JUSTICE, FREEDOM, and EQUALITY were clear.
- The Artist explained that the inclusion of the word EQUITY was the result of discussion with his poet collaborators. The poets felt that the word EQUITY conveyed a larger idea of inclusion.
- Chief Judge Mahon expressed a preference for the use of words and concepts traditionally found in the Constitution or other formational documents. He reflected that the word equity could resonate differently within the community. He further shared that he and other members of the judiciary hoped for constitutional and formational concepts and terms in the Artwork that inspired confidence and comfort in community members coming to the Courthouse to engage in their civic duty or who were about to be participants in the judicial process at the Courthouse.
- Ari Jolly asked CCGJ Senior Leadership to clarify the choices before the Panel. Specifically, she asked for confirmation that the Panel had the option to approve the current version, approve the text with some changes from the Artist, or to not approve the text.
- Kat Wright affirmed Ms. Jolly's understand and advised that if the Panel did request text changes, then the Panel would need to reconvene to review the Artwork with those changes.
- Caitlín Doherty asked about and Ms. Wright confirmed that an affirmative vote by a majority of the Panel in attendance was needed for the vote to pass on this date.
- Lori Boyer asked if Chief Judge Mahon had recommendations that would be more appropriate for the Artwork in front of the Courthouse with more Constitutional linkage.
- Chief Judge Mahon reaffirmed a preference for text that is founded within the Constitution or Foundational documents such as the words "truth" or "truths."
- Ms. Doherty mentioned that she felt the word equity speaks to fairness and impartiality, which would speak to what happens at the courthouse.
- Chief Judge Mahon replied that "equity" is a bit more nuanced.
- Anne-Marie Knight explained her understanding and support for the word "equity. She stated that "equity" and "equality" were different and supported the inclusion of the word "equity" in the Artwork.
- Members of the Panel suggested that the word "truth" was a viable option that could fit well within the work.
  
- In suggesting this change, the Panel understood that the action proposed would fall under Section 2 Version 2 within the Resolution in which the Panel would request the Artist to make changes to the Artwork text.
- Ms. Doherty stated that before making this change to the Artwork, the Artist should be brought into the conversation. She felt that the development of the Artwork has been an intense process and that it would be respectful to engage the Artist in the conversation.
- Ms. Wright then directed the conversation to the Artist, asking for comments to the proposal to changing out the word equity with to the words truth or truths.
- Mr. Garten stated he would have to go back to his colleagues, as these were 4 major concepts that were accepted in the first artwork concept review, which secured him the commission. He requested consensus from the Panel before opening up the collaboration again with his colleagues. Ms. Wright replied that it should then be opened up to a vote to gain consensus.
- Ms. Boyer then explained that the words "flags" in the text could also raise certain considerations. Judge Hudson agreed and suggested that deletion of that one word might address the issues discussed
- Judge Hudson and Chief Judge Mahon supported the suggested edits to the text of the art piece since the artwork will appear in front of the courthouse for many years.

- After discussing the options available to the Panel, the Panel understood that it could also seek the edits discussed from the Artist at this meeting and vote to approve the artwork as amended if the Artist agreed to the requested edits.
- Chief Judge Mahon then made the motion that the word "EQUITY" be changed to either "TRUTH" or "TRUTHS", and that the word "flags" be deleted from the passage in the lightbox "Justice." Further, should the Artist accept those changes the Panel recommended proceeding to fabrication without the need of any further meeting by the Panel. Should the Artist not support these changes, the Artist was asked to so inform the Panel
- Ms. Wright then requested a vote of Section 2 Version 2 combined with Version 1.
- Chair Kim asked if there was any public comment, and none was received.
- Ms. Doherty asked for clarification to the motion and offered that it should be restated to say if the Artist/Poets were not in agreement with the text changes, they should offer revisions which would mean the Panel would have to reconvene. If they agreed with the revisions as requested, the Panel would not need to reconvene.
- The Panel continued to discuss the motion and how best to proceed. Joelle Dillard advised that the majority of the Panel present would need to agree to pass the motion, so 4 of 7 would need to affirm the motion.

**ACTION ITEMS - VOTING, *Kimberly Kim***

- Chair Kim presented the motion for vote ("equity" being changed to "truth" or "truths" and "flags" being removed from the Justice lightbox text):

Kimberly Kim	No	Ann-Marie Knight	No
Chief Judge Mark Mahon	Yes	Teresa Eichner-not in attendance	-
Lori Boyer	Yes	Caitlín Doherty	No
Chris Flagg	Yes	Judge Dawn Hudson	Yes

**NEXT STEPS, *Kimberly Kim***

- Ms. Wright asked for a timeline of when the Panel could expect to hear back from the Poet Collaborators to determine if the ASP would need to reconvene and offered to facilitate as needed.

**IMPORTANT DATES**

1. **Next APPC Meeting: June 14, 2023**, Jessie Ball duPont Center, Conference Room 318 (Third Floor)

**ADJOURNMENT, *Kimberly Kim (5:10PM)***